

## JTSB Safety Recommendation to the EAST WAY LLC.

May 30, 2014

Marine Accident between  
Container ship “KOTA DUTA” and Cargo ship “TANYA KARPINSKAYA” (Collision)  
Occurred at Port of Niigata Higashi Ku, Niigata City, Niigata Prefecture  
Vicinity of 180° true, 4,900m from Port of Niigata Higashi Ku  
West Breakwater Lighthouse, Japan  
on February 7, 2012.

It is probable that this accident occurred because KOTA DUTA and TANYA KARPINSKAYA collided with each other due to the facts that the master of KOTA DUTA and the master of TANYA KARPINSKAYA agreed to the conduct of vessel for both vessels to alter to port to pass on the starboard side via VHF, that the vessels continued to navigate after the master of KOTA DUTA put the helm hard to port and the master of TANYA KARPINSKAYA put the helm to port at 15° in an attempt to execute the agreement, that they kept approaching each other in the situation that was different from the agreed conduct of vessel without being able to recognize any change in the heading when the vessels approached each other in the situation in which their courses would cross where the Dredged Passages crossed while KOTA DUTA was proceeding northeast after leaving the West Wharf No.3 Quay and while TANYA KARPINSKAYA was proceeding south-southeast from the Central Wharf East Quay toward the South Wharf in Port of Niigata Higashi Ku.

It is probable that the master of TANYA KARPINSKAYA offered the conduct of vessel to pass on the starboard side due to the facts that it was easy for TANYA KARPINSKAYA to alter to port due to the large area of waters on the port side of TANYA KARPINSKAYA when they were called by KOTA DUTA via VHF to inquire about TANYA KARPINSKAYA’s name in Russian, that he believed it would be safer if the two vessels’ courses did not cross in order to avoid collision because he could not anticipate where in the passage crossing KOTA DUTA would alter to port, believed that KOTA DUTA would execute the contents agreed via VHF despite the fact that there was a difference between the anticipated actions of KOTA DUTA according to the master of TANYA KARPINSKAYA and the actual actions due to the agreement of the conduct of vessel made between the two vessels, and continued to approach the other vessel in the situation in which he could not recognize any change in the heading.

It is somewhat likely that the master of TANYA KARPINSKAYA could have learned the existence and movements of KOTA DUTA 2-3 minutes before sighting it and taken measures to avoid the situation in which the two vessels approached each

other where the passages crossed by decelerating and other means if the master or chief officer of TANYA KARPINSKAYA had carefully observed the radar display and commenced systematic analysis.

Due to this, the Board recommends EAST WAY LLC. to take the following measures to ensure safety while underway in view of the results of this accident investigation

- (1) Instruct masters and deck officers of vessels belonging to EAST WAY LLC. and vessels under their management to carefully observe radar displays while underway to commence systematic analysis and conduct education by learning from this accident case when visiting the vessels.
- (2) Notify masters and deck officers of vessels belonging to EAST WAY LLC. and vessels under their management to recognize the following risks of using VHF by learning from this accident case. In addition, if they have checklists used to navigate in narrow channels and congested waters, promote awareness by establishing items to reconfirm the risks of using VHF.
  - (i) It is possible that two vessels approach each other and have no time to take actions to avoid collision in case the agreement is not executed if those persons conning the two vessels take time to agree on the conduct of vessel and the vessels underway in the original course at the original speed during that time.
  - (ii) It is possible that those persons conning the vessels would believe that the other vessel would execute the contents to which they had agreed via VHF even if there is a difference between the anticipated actions of the other vessel according to the person conning the vessel and the actual actions after agreeing on the conduct of vessel and lose the opportunity to take actions to avoid collision.